

COOK ISLANDS JUDGMENTS

1981 - 1985

A Collection of Judgments of the
High Court and Court of Appeal
of the Cook Islands

Compiled by Professor Don Paterson,
Emeritus Professor of Law
The University of the South Pacific



Published by The School of Law, The University of the South Pacific,
Emalus Campus, Port Vila,
Vanuatu

© Don Paterson 2002

Funding assistance provided by
The University of the South Pacific and
The British High Commission, Wellington, New Zealand

ISBN: 982-01-0540-4
ISBN (Set): 982-01-0538-2

Printed by Goprint, Brisbane, Australia

COOK ISLANDS JUDGMENTS
1981-1985

ALPHABETICAL INDEX

	Page
A	
<i>Auto Holdings Ltd v Silk & Boyd Ltd</i>	75
<i>Auto Holdings Ltd v Silk & Boyd Ltd (No 2)</i>	162
B	
<i>BP South West Pacific Ltd v Collector of Inland Revenue</i>	15
C	
<i>Chapman v Cook Islands Public Service Board of Appeal</i>	63
<i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
F	
<i>Foote v Rolls and Hibiscus House LtdI</i>	81
<i>Foote v Rolls, Hibiscus House Ltd and Rolls</i>	189
<i>Financial Enterprises Ltd v Native Landowners of Te Kauariki Pt SectionI 131 Matavera</i>	285
H	
<i>Harnish v Kauvai and others</i>	311
<i>Heather v Fraser</i>	100
<i>Henry v Attorney-General</i>	128
I	
<i>Ihaka v Nicholas and Nicholas</i>	313
<i>Ingram Te Upoko Te Pa Mataiapo v Amarama and Amarama</i>	318
M	
<i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
<i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General</i>	231
<i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General (No 2)</i>	289
<i>Matavera Constituency, In re</i>	206
<i>Mitchell v Land Owners of land of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
<i>Mitiaro Constituency, In re</i>	224
<i>Mitiaro Trading Co Ltd v Estall, Strickland, Joseph, Henry and Strickland</i>	18
O	
<i>Overseas Constituency, In re</i>	251
P	
<i>Pauarii, In re Vaine Nooroa O Taratangi</i>	295
<i>Pauarii, In re Vaine Nooroa O Taratangi (No 2)</i>	298
<i>Pokoati, In re Taimata</i>	204
<i>Police v Ingram</i>	261

Q	
<i>Queen's Representative, In re a Reference by</i>	166
<i>Queen's Representative, In re a Reference by</i> <i>(Supplementary Opinion)</i>	184
R	
<i>Raina, In re Tamu, Deceased</i>	275
<i>Reference by Queen's Representative, In re</i>	166
<i>Reference by Queen's Representative, In re</i> <i>(Supplementary Opinion)</i>	184
<i>Rhodes v Mani</i>	87
<i>Roi, In re Teaukura</i>	303
<i>Ruaau Constituency, In re</i>	83
<i>Ruaau Constituency (No 2), In re</i>	154
<i>Ruaau Constituency (No 3), In re</i>	158
<i>Ruaau Constituency (No 4), In re</i>	213
S	
<i>Sandilands v Carlaw</i>	92
<i>Solicitor-General v Porter</i>	78
<i>Staples v Bertram and Mitchell</i>	70
T	
<i>Takuvaine Constituency, In re</i>	221
<i>Teenui-Mapumai Constituency, In re</i>	150
<i>Tengatangi-Areora-Ngatiarua Constituency, In re</i>	145
V	
<i>Vakatini, In re Ina</i>	60

CONSTITUTION AND LEGISLATION CITED

CONSTITUTION

	Page
Art 13 <i>In re a Reference by the Queen's Representative</i>	166
Art 34 <i>In re a Reference by the Queen's Representative</i>	166
Art 41 <i>Henry v Attorney-General</i>	128
Art 64(1)(b) <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
Art 64(1)(e) <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107

LEGISLATION

STATUTES AND SUBSIDIARY LEGISLATION CITED

<u>Cook Islands Act 1915 (NZ)</u>	
s45 <i>Mitiaro Trading Co Ltd v Estall, Strickland, Joseph, Henry and Strickland</i>	18
s391 <i>Ingram Te Upoko Te Pa Mataiapo v Amarama and Amarama</i>	318
s409 B <i>Mitchell v Landowners of lands of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
<u>Cook Islands Amendment Act 1950 (NZ)</u>	
s19 <i>Mitchell v Landowners of lands of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
s50 <i>In re Teaukura Roi</i>	303
<i>Ingram Te Upoko Te Pa Mataiapo v Amarama and Amarama</i>	318
<u>Cook Islands Commercial Fishing Regulations 1951 (NZ)</u>	
<i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General</i>	231
<u>Criminal Procedure Act 1980-81</u>	
s111 <i>Police v Ingram</i>	26
<u>Customs Act 1911 (NZ)</u>	
ss46, 256, 257 <i>Solicitor-General v Porter</i>	78

	Page
<u>Development Investment Act 1977</u>	
<i>Foote v Rolls and Hibiscus House Ltd</i>	81
<i>Foote v Rolls, Hibiscus House Ltd and Rolls</i>	189
<u>Electoral Act 1966</u>	
s58	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No2)</i>	154
s60(9)	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No3)</i>	158
s69	
<i>In re Teenui - Mapumai Constituency</i>	150
<i>In re Tengtangi - Areora - Ngatiarua Constituency</i>	145
s73(1)	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No2)</i>	154
s73A(2)	
<i>In re Overseas Constituency</i>	251
s78	
<i>In re Overseas Constituency</i>	251
<u>Rehearing of Te Puna Lands Act 1980</u>	
<i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
<u>Turnover Tax Act 1980</u>	
<i>BP South West Pacific Ltd v Collector of Inland Revenue</i>	15

**COOK ISLANDS JUDGMENTS
1981-1985**

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER

<u>Administrative law</u>	Page
Bias	
- rule against bias applied only where there is a duty to act judicially <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
Excess of jurisdiction	
- discretion of Public Service Appeal Board cannot be fettered by qualifications fixed by Public Service Commissioner <i>Chapman v Cook Islands Public Service Board of Appeal</i>	63
Natural justice and fairness	
- not applicable to refusal to renew residence permit <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
- reasons for decision not required to be given <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
- rule against bias applied only where there is a duty to act judicially <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
Reasons for administrative decisions not required to be given <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
 <u>Adoption</u>	
Customary adoption	
- recognition by near family <i>In re Tanu Raina Deceased</i>	275
<i>In re Vaine Nooroa O Taratangi Pauarii</i>	295
<i>In re Vaine Nooroa O Taratangi Pauarii (No 2)</i>	298
 <u>Appeal</u>	
Findings as to credibility of witnesses will not be lightly interfered with by appellate court <i>Staples v Bertram and Mitchell</i>	70
Findings of fact will not be lightly interfered with by appellate court <i>In re Ina Vakatini</i>	60
<i>IngramTe Upoko Te Pa Mataiapo v Amarama and Amarama</i>	318
No appeal from refusal to cancel occupation order <i>In re Teaukura Roi</i>	303
Order for security for costs may be appealed <i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General (No 2)</i>	289

	Page
<u>Constitution</u>	
Amendment, procedures for <i>Henry v Attorney-General</i>	128
Freedom from discrimination and right to equality of treatment <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
Fundamental rights and freedoms provisions	
- applicability to existing laws <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
-interpretation <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
Interpretation, principles of <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
<i>Henry v Attorney-General</i>	128
Prime Minister, appointment of, procedures to be used to determine support of members of Parliament	
<i>In re a Reference by the Queen's Representative</i>	166
<i>In re a Reference by the Queen's Representative (No 2)</i>	184
<u>Contract</u>	
Collateral warranty <i>Mitiaro Trading Co Ltd v Estall, Strickland, Joseph, Henry and Strickland</i>	18
Company not incorporated - contract made on behalf of unincorporated company void <i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General</i>	231
Illegality	
- effect of Cook Islands Commercial Fishing Regulations 1951 (NZ) <i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General</i>	231
- effect of Development Investment Act 1977 <i>Foote v Rolls and Hibiscus House Ltd</i>	81
<i>Foote v Rolls and Hibiscus House Ltd and Rolls</i>	189
Intention to form contract <i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor-General</i>	231
Mistake	
Mistake of one party contributed to, or known by, the other <i>Heather v Fraser</i>	100

	Page
Oppressive, unreasonable or improvident contract - relief under s45 Cook Islands Act 1915 <i>Mitiaro Trading Co Ltd v Estall, Strickland, Joseph, Henry and Strickland</i>	18
Rectification <i>Heather v Fraser</i>	100
 <u>Criminal Law and Procedure</u>	
Costs against the prosecution - principles to be applied <i>Rhodes v Mani</i>	87
Discharge of defendant before trial <i>Police v Ingram</i>	261
Discretion of court to admit evidence, which is not strictly admissible, if no miscarriage of justice would be caused <i>Police v Ingram</i>	261
Discretion of justice to direct that accused be discharged - test to be applied <i>Police v Ingram</i>	261
False practices - ingredients of offence <i>Police v Ingram</i>	261
Indecent documents - importation only an offence if for distribution, exhibition or sale - importation for own use not an offence <i>Solicitor-General v Porter</i>	78
 <u>Customs</u>	
Importation of indecent documents <i>Solicitor-General v Porter</i>	78
 <u>Defamation</u>	
Making of defamatory statement - evidence inadequate <i>Staples v Bertram and Mitchell</i>	70
 <u>Domestic Proceedings</u>	
Mistress- entitlement to property acquired during relationship <i>Sandilands v Carlaw</i>	92

	Page
<u>Election</u>	
Corrupt Practices	
- agency	
<i>In re Mitiaro Constituency</i>	224
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 3)</i>	158
- by unsuccessful candidate	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 4)</i>	213
- bribery	
<i>In re Tenganangi - Areora - Ngatiarua Constituency</i>	145
<i>In re Teenui - Mapumai Constituency</i>	150
<i>In re Matavera Constituency</i>	206
<i>In re Mitiaro Constituency</i>	224
- treating	
<i>In re Tenganangi - Areora - Ngatiarua Constituency</i>	145
<i>In re Teenui - Mapumai Constituency</i>	150
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 3)</i>	158
<i>In re Matavera Constituency</i>	206
<i>In re Mitiaro Constituency</i>	224
Irregularities	
- kinds of irregularities	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency</i>	83
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 2)</i>	154
<i>In re Overseas Constituency</i>	251
- material effect upon election	
<i>In re Overseas Constituency</i>	251
Opening of ballot box - person entitled	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency</i>	83
Recount, finality of	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 2)</i>	154
Unsuccessful candidate - corrupt practices by	
<i>In re Ruaau Constituency (No 4)</i>	213
Unsuccessful petition - costs will be awarded against petitioner if no adequate grounds	
<i>In re Matavera Constituency</i>	206

	Page
<u>Evidence</u>	
Discretion of court to admit evidence provided no miscarriage of justice would be caused <i>Police v Ingram</i>	261
<u>Interpretation</u>	
Constitution	
- fundamental rights provisions not retrospective <i>Clarke v Karika</i>	107
- principles of interpretation <i>Henry v Attorney-General</i>	128
Lease	
- "gross receipts derived from or arising out of" leased land <i>Financial Enterprises Ltd v Native Landowners of Te Kavariki Pt Section 131 Matavera</i>	285
Statutes	
Crown not bound except by express words or necessary implication <i>Mitchell v Landowners of land of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
Mandatory or directory <i>In re Overseas Constituency</i>	251
Particular statutes are not revoked by later general statutes <i>Mitchell v Landowners of land of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
<u>Judicial review</u>	
Bias	
- rule against bias applied only where there is a duty to act judicially <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
Excess of jurisdiction	
- discretion of Public Service Appeal Board cannot be fettered by qualifications fixed by Public Service Commissioner <i>Chapman v Cook Islands Public Service Board of Appeal</i>	63
Natural justice and fairness	
- not applicable to refusal to renew residence permit <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
reasons for decision not required to be given <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
- rule against bias applied only where there is a duty to act judicially <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48

	Page
Reasons for administrative decisions not required to be given <i>McDonald v Robati</i>	48
<u>Lease or Sublease</u>	
Amount of rent payable - percentage of "gross receipts derived from or arising out of demised land" <i>Financial Enterprises Ltd v Native Landowners of Te Kaurariki Pt Section 131, Matavera</i>	285
Consent to assignment cannot be unreasonably withheld <i>Harnish v Kauvai and others</i>	311
Crown as lessee not bound by s409 B Cook Islands Act 1915 <i>Mitchell v Landowners of land of Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
Leasehold settled on trust void for breach of rule against perpetuity <i>In re Taimata Pokoati</i>	204
Mistake, of one party as to term <i>Heather v Fraser</i>	100
Term, dispute as to length <i>Heather v Fraser</i>	100
Validation by legislation <i>Mitchell v Landowners of land at Aitutaki Airport</i>	42
<u>Occupation order</u>	
Annulment of occupation order obtained by fraud - proof of fraud <i>Ingram Te Upoko Te Pa Mataiapo v Amarama and Amarama</i>	318
Consent of "majority of the owners" - meaning of this phrase <i>Ihaka v Nicholas and Nicholas</i>	313
Direct issue only entitled to succeed <i>In re Teaukura Roi</i>	303
Discretion of court to make occupation order <i>Ihaka v Nicholas and Nicholas</i>	313
No appeal from refusal to cancel occupation order <i>In re Teaukura Roi</i>	303
<u>Perpetuity, rule against</u>	
Effect of breach <i>In re Taimata Pokoati</i>	204

	Page
<u>Practice</u>	
Non-suit of plaintiff - lack of evidence <i>Auto Holdings Ltd v Silk & Boyd Ltd</i>	75
Order for security for costs may be appealed <i>Marine Resources (Cook Islands) Ltd v Solicitor – General (No2)</i>	289
<u>Revenue</u>	
Turnover Tax - liability to pay <i>BP South West Pacific Ltd v Collector of Inland Revenue</i>	15
<u>Succession Order</u>	
Adopted children, some related by blood, others not <i>In re Tanu Raina Deceased</i>	275
Custom adoption must be recognized by near family <i>In re Tanu Raina Deceased</i>	275
<i>In re Vaine Pauarii</i>	295
<i>In re Vaine Pauarii (No 2)</i>	298
Direct issue only entitled to succeed <i>In re Teaukura Roi</i>	303
<u>Title</u>	
Entitlement of eldest child unless unsuitable <i>In re Ina Vakatini</i>	60
<u>Torts</u>	
Liability of employer for negligence of employee outside course of normal duties <i>Auto Holdings Ltd v Silk & Boyd Ltd (No 2)</i>	162
Negligence - lack of evidence - non-suit <i>Auto Holdings Ltd v Silk & Boyd Ltd</i>	75
<u>Trust</u>	
Breach of rule against perpetuity <i>In re Taimata Pokoati</i>	204